

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
EASTERN DIVISION

OHIO CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	Civil Action No. 3:06-cv-977-MEF
)	
MANIFOLD CONSTRUCTION, LLC, et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

ANSWER

COME NOW the Defendants, Whittelsey Properties, Inc. and C.S. Whittelsey, IV (collectively referred to herein sometimes as “Whittelsey”), and in response to Plaintiff’s complaint for declaratory judgment, reserving the right to amend or supplement upon the discovery of additional facts, defenses and/or claims, states as follows:

1. Whittelsey admits the allegations contained in paragraph 1 of Plaintiff’s complaint.
2. Whittelsey admits the allegations contained in paragraph 2 of Plaintiff’s complaint.
3. Whittelsey admits the allegations contained in paragraph 3 of Plaintiff’s complaint.
4. Whittelsey denies the allegations contained in paragraph 4 of Plaintiff’s complaint and demands strict proof thereof.
5. Although Whittelsey did file suit against Defendants, Manifold Construction, LLC, Jack Manifold and Melissa Manifold, in the Circuit Court of Lee County, Alabama, on or

about the 23rd day of February, 2005, Whittelsey denies the remaining allegations contained in paragraph 5 of Plaintiff's complaint and demands strict proof thereof.

6. Whittelsey admits the allegations contained in paragraph 6 of Plaintiff's complaint.

7. Whittelsey denies the allegations contained in paragraph 7 of Plaintiff's complaint and demands strict proof thereof. Furthermore, Whittelsey denies that Plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief requested in its complaint.

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

8. Whittelsey pleads the general issue.

9. Whittelsey asserts the affirmative defense of waiver of this proceeding, as Plaintiff withdrew its motion for limited intervention in the Circuit Court of Lee County, Alabama, Case Number CV-05-137, to submit "interrogatories to the jury relevant to the issue of [Plaintiff's] duties under two liability insurance policies to [Defendants, Manifold Construction, LLC and Jack Manifold]." See Exhibit B to Whittelsey's Brief in Support of Motion to Dismiss.

10. Whittelsey asserts the affirmative defense of lack of subject matter jurisdiction, as Plaintiff's waiver, as set forth above, allows the issues raised by Plaintiff in its complaint to only proceed forward in a state court action pursuant to Ala.Code 1975 § 27-23-2 ("Alabama's Direct Action Statute") in which action diversity cannot exist.

11. Whittelsey reasserts the factors listed in the case of Ameritas Variable Life Ins. Co. v. Roach, 411 F.3d 1328 (11thCir. 2005) as set forth in Whittelsey's motion to dismiss Plaintiff's claim.

JURY DEMAND

12. Whittelsey demands trial by jury as to all issues raised by Plaintiff's complaint and Whittelsey's answer thereto.

Respectfully submitted this the 25th day of July 2007.

WHITTELSEY, WHITTELSEY & POOLE, P.C.

/s/ Davis B. Whittelsey
BY: DAVIS B. WHITTELSEY (WHI067)
E-mail: dwhittelsey@wwp-law.com

/s/ Robert G. Poole
BY: ROBERT G. POOLE (POO014)
E-mail: bpooles@wwp-law.com
Attorneys for Defendants
Post Office Box 106
Opelika, Alabama 36803-0106
Tel.: (334) 745-7766
Fax: (334) 745-7666

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have served a copy of the foregoing document on the parties listed below electronically or by placing a copy of the same in the United States mail, postage prepaid, to their correct address on this the 25th day of July, 2007.

Christopher Lyle McIlwain
HUBBARD, SMITH, MCILWAIN, BAKERFILED & BROWDER, P.C.
Post Office Box 2427
Tuscaloosa, Alabama 35403

Bradley J. Smith
CLARK, DOLAN, MORSE, ONCALE & HAIR, P.C.
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 850
Birmingham, Alabama 35209

James D. McLaughlin
DAVIS & MCLAUGHLIN
324 East Magnolia Avenue
Auburn, Alabama 36830

/s/ Davis B. Whittelsey
DAVIS B. WHITTELSEY